

Canal Winchester

*City Hall
45 East Waterloo Street
Canal Winchester, OH 43110*



****Special Meeting Minutes****

October 13, 2022

7:00 PM

Landmarks Commission

*Pete Lynch - Chairman
David Craycraft – Vice-Chairman
Rich Dobda - Secretary
Roger White
Jamoya Cox
Dr. Scott Kelly
Whit Wardell*

Call To Order

Time In: 7:00pm

Declaring A Quorum (Roll Call)

A motion was made by Roger White, seconded by David Craycraft, that Jamoya Cox be excused from the meeting.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 – Peter Lynch, Rich Dobda, Roger White, David Craycraft, Dr. Scott Kelly & Whit Wardell

Excused: 1 – Jamoya Cox

Pending Applications**CA-22-001 UPDATE**

Property Owner: Jerry McCann & Erika Tucker
Applicant: David Craycraft
Location: 36 West Mound Street
Request: Paint Color Approval for rear addition

Jamoya Cox Joined the Meeting at 7:01pm.

Mr. Moore presented the application for Jerry McCann and Erika Tucker for property located at 36 West Mound Street. The applicants are requesting approval for the paint color of their new rear addition that was approved by the Landmarks Commission in February 2022. The applicant is requesting Sherwin Williams 'Iron Ore' be the primary siding color for the rear addition and Sherwin Williams 'Stamped Concrete' for the exterior trim, front deck boards, front door and front porch gable.

Staff noted that the installed windows on the house are black vinyl, the roof is a black dimensional asphalt shingle, the soffits and gutters will be black metal and a portion of the rear addition has a black standing seam metal roof.

Staff shared with the commission photographs of the current progress of construction and two renderings, one of the front and one of the rear that has the addition painted with the 'Iron Ore' color for review.

Mr. Craycraft noted that the owner has hardi-board that is painted with samples of the proposed colors.

Mr. White noted that he thinks the rendering staff put together looks darker than the paint sample being passed around. Staff did note that the rendering would look slightly different than a picture and that would look different

than the paint sample outdoors or viewing indoors. The digital color code for the color was used to get as close as possible.

The applicant did note that the rendering is digital and she believes the rendering does look darker than the paint sample being passed around for discussion. Mrs. Tucker discussed that initially she wanted the addition to be black but ended up going with this darker gray tone being presented.

The commission clarified the facia material passed around with the main siding color sample and the trim color sample with the applicant.

Dr. Kelly asked what the headers on the original house are. The applicant stated they are painted now and ideally they would be a natural stone color but they have not been able to get the old paint removed without damaging the window. Mrs. Tucker stated she would propose to paint the window trim the darker 'Iron Ore' color as well. However, if they could find a color that was closer to a natural stone color that would not be out of the question. Right now, they are the creamy yellow color.

The commission asked if they have tried to bead blast the sandstone header and sills to remove the paint. Mr. McCann stated that they had someone come out and look at sandblasting it and they were advised it may erode too much of the stone away.

Mr. White noted that on the rear of the building there is board and batten siding where the approved plans called for horizontal siding so that also needs to be reviewed for approval by the commission this evening. Mr. Craycraft noted that he was unaware that change was made in the field. Mrs. Tucker discussed she felt the battens gave better contrast at the rear of the home.

Mr. Lynch stated he personally has not issues with the rear siding profile changes.

Mr. Lynch stated he would like to kick off the discussion by stating that the role of the Landmarks Commission is to maintain the aesthetics of the downtown community, both Historic and Preservation. The commission tries to have additions onto homes be relative to the size of the house or smaller, this addition is pushing those boundaries. What the dark color does in this instance is it overpowers what is historic in the front. The example photograph of the home in German Village has the dark rear addition that is much smaller than the main structure. It does not take your focus. When the dark color is dominant, it becomes the boss of the building. Mr. Lynch stated that the 'Iron Ore' would be a great accent color for windows, mailboxes, trim, even flowerboxes. Black absorbs all other colors. Black tends to also grab your eye and will take your focus off this historic 1800's house.

Mrs. Tucker stated that Mr. Lynch's comments is the exact opposite reason why she chose the dark color. Mrs. Tucker stated in her opinion, white draws your eye to the addition and not the primary building. The black color fades away and accentuates the brick on the home. White would be stark.

Mr. Lynch stated that he agrees white would be a stark contrast and not that he is suggesting white but the black in this instance would be very dominant. The garage that was just recently painted at the corner is an example where black paint does not look right.

Mrs. Tucker stated she likes the garage down the street and this is really a matter of opinion. They did an inspiration tour through German Village and the black makes a good backdrop for this home to let it shine.

Mr. Lynch stated he is basing his opinion on a historical background where black was never used and shades of black were very rarely used. Mrs. Tucker stated that the 'Iron Ore' color is a dark gray and not black. Mr. Lynch stated that it is lighter than a traditional black but this color is on the same color swatch as 4 other shades of black.

Dr. Kelly spoke with the commission about options to break the color up some like having the inset be the lighter trim color. The applicant stated she also has considered having the inset or soffit be the lighter stamped concrete color to help break it up.

Mr. Lynch stated that he does think the monotone paint scheme does tone things down but adding a different color to the west elevation recessed area may make it look choppy.

Mr. White commented that what he does not like about the dark paint scheme is the addition loses all definition in the windows and trim down that side. Mr. Lynch affirmed stating that is why historically that dark color or monotone pallet was not used. The black paint is a trendy color now but with you lose a lot of architectural detail.

Mrs. Tucker discussed that she feels the addition does not need to meet all of the historical markers because it is new.

Mr. Lynch discusses the photo comparison between the rear addition battens and how the shadow lines get lost when the paint scheme is dark as what is proposed with the applicant.

Mr. Craycraft asked the commission if the trim on the house including around the windows and corner trim was different than the primary color if that would help. The commission discussed other homes in the area

including one two doors down and how the addition has a slightly lighter color trim than the siding on the addition, however the addition is not quite as dark as what is proposed in this application.

Mr. Dobda asked the applicant if the sills on the existing home could be the stamped concrete color. The applicants noted that it could be. The applicant notes the existing sills are painted the yellow color of the old addition.

The commission and the applicant discussed color options and how the plans could be manipulated for approval at the meeting.

The applicant discusses that they feel the rendering is not a fair representation for the color and makes it look darker than it actually is. Dr. Kelly added that while the rendering may be off from the actual paint color, the color is still very monochromatic and when the home is all the same color you lose the detail in the inset, window trim, and character gets lost. The home design has a lot of great character.

Mrs. Tucker states that she thinks a light color would overpower the house and a dark color would compliment the home design. The applicant noted that she is unsure where to move forward from here.

Mr. Lynch stated that he would not personally recommend a color but does feel it needs toned down a bit. Monochromatic is not always a bad thing but it does tend to hide details.

Mrs. Tucker debated on whether the non-historic addition on the home needs to meet the same standards as the front portion of the home.

Mr. Lynch discussed that the distance between their home and the neighbors is quite sizable compared to other homes in the area. Mr. Craycraft noted he is working on plans for an addition to that home to the west currently so that gap would get smaller.

Staff did read off the Old Town Guidelines as it relates to additions and colors in general. Mr. Lynch notes that in historic homes black was not part of the pallet. It was considered a non-color. From a historic perspective, Mr. Lynch notes he does not agree with the color being presented. The applicant notes that the color 'Iron Ore' is a dark gray and not black.

Mr. McCann asked the commission how do they proceed given the feedback this evening. The applicant explained they do not want to come back to a future meeting with another color that the commission does not find to be appropriate.

The commission spoke to the applicant about looking at a lighter shade for a monochromatic look or looking at painting some of the trim a secondary color on the house and the addition so they tie into each other. The commission discussed the existing trim on the brick portion of the home and how that could be a more natural color and have that carry over to the addition window trim.

The commission discussed having the 'Iron Ore' as the trim color and having the lighter 'Stamped Concrete' for the siding. The applicant noted that she was not fond of having the darker color being the trim only and was looking for a darker siding color with a lighter trim color.

The applicant noted they will look at lighter tones than the 'Iron Ore' but is not fond of having a two-toned addition. The applicant stated she would like to think about the decision before coming back so they can visualize what the changes would look like.

The commission asked what color they planned on repainting the window frames and sills on the brick portion of the home. The applicant stated the 'Iron Ore' color but if the addition had the lighter trim color, they may be amenable to having the trim on the brick portion being the lighter 'Stamped Concrete' gray.

The commission asked the applicant to consider having the window trim and soffits on the addition being painted the 'Stamped Concrete' and that would allow for the details to pop out. Mr. Lynch stated that he also likes that color but the applicants may want to change it depending on what main color they decide for the addition siding. The applicant noted that they would explore trimming the windows and other accent features out in a different shade if they could have a darker paint color.

The commission did recommend doing paint samples on the siding to show the commission what it could look like, rather than a rendering.

Old Business

New Business

Adjournment

Time Out: 7:54pm

A motion was made by Peter Lynch and seconded by Whit Wardell, that this meeting be adjourned.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 – Peter Lynch, Rich Dobda, Roger White, David Craycraft, Jamoya Cox, Dr. Scott Kelly & Whit Wardell

Date

Landmarks Chairman